



ECONOMIC PROSPERITY_{IV}

in THE CITY OF DULUTH, MN



Arts and Economic Prosperity IV was conducted by Americans for the Arts, the nation's leading nonprofit organization for advancing the arts in America. Established in 1960, we are dedicated to representing and serving local communities and creating opportunities for every American to participate in and appreciate all forms of the arts.

Copyright 2015 by Americans for the Arts, 1000 Vermont Avenue NW, 6th Floor, Washington, DC 20005. *Arts & Economic Prosperity*® is a registered trademark of Americans for the Arts. Reprinted by permission. Printed in the United States.

Table of Contents

The Arts Mean Business By Robert L. Lynch, President and CEO, Americans for the Arts	1
The Economic Impact of the Nonprofit Arts and Culture Industry in the City of Duluth	3
Defining Economic Impact	3
Economic Impact of the ENTIRE Nonprofit Arts and Culture Industry	4
Direct and Indirect Economic Impact: How a Dollar is Re- Spent in the Economy	4
Economic Impact of Spending by Nonprofit Arts and Culture ORGANIZATIONS	6
An Economic Impact Beyond Dollars: Volunteerism	7
The Value of In-Kind Contributions to Arts Organizations	7
Economic Impact of Spending by Nonprofit Arts and Culture AUDIENCES	8
Cultural Tourists Spend More	9
Cultural Events Attract New Dollars and Retain Local Dollars	10
Conclusion	11
Arts & Economic Prosperity IV Calculator	13
Economic Impact per \$100,000 of Spending by Nonprofit Arts and Culture ORGANIZATIONS	13
Economic Impact per \$100,000 of Spending by Nonprofit Arts and Culture AUDIENCES	14
Making Comparisons with Similar Study Regions	15
About This Study	17
Frequently Used Terms	21
Frequently Asked Questions	23
Acknowledgments	25



The Health and Impacts of the Nonprofit Arts and Culture Sector in Minnesota By Sheila Smith, Executive Director of Minnesota Citizens for the Arts

This economic impact study was commissioned as part of a larger effort called *Creative Minnesota*.

We have known for a long time that the arts and culture are important to Minnesota. They enhance our quality of life, bring diverse communities together, and make our state a magnet for jobs and businesses. However, we have not had enough data to *measure* the impact of the arts and culture on an ongoing basis.

Now we can quantify that, in addition to its stages and museums, the nonprofit arts and culture sector is also a substantial industry in the State of Minnesota generating **\$1.2 billion** in total economic impact annually.

As the most comprehensive report ever done of the creative sector, *Creative Minnesota* is a new effort to fill the gaps in available information about Minnesota's cultural field and to improve our understanding of its importance to our quality of life and economy. It kicks off a new centralized, concentrated and long term endeavor to collect and report data on the creative sector every two years for analysis, education and advocacy.

Our first *Creative Minnesota* report is a snapshot of the health and impacts of nonprofit arts and culture organizations in 2013 and looks at their spending and their audiences as well as other indicators of the sector's health and impact on the economy.

The report leverages new in-depth research made possible because of Minnesota's participation in the Cultural Data Project (culturaldata.org). The benefits of the arts and culture are not limited to our metropolitan areas. The first round of *Creative Minnesota* released February 2015 showed **substantial economic impact from the arts and culture in every corner of the state**, from the Arrowhead to the plains of Southwest Minnesota and from the Red River Valley to the river lands of the Southeast.

This second round of studies done in October 2015 looking at cities and counties across the state also finds the arts and culture impacting economies everywhere. The 29 state, regional and local reports done to date and more can be found at **creativemn.org.**

Creative Minnesota was developed by a collaborative of arts and culture funders in partnership with **Minnesota Citizens for the Arts** (MCA). The *Creative Minnesota* team includes: Minnesota Citizens for the Arts, **the McKnight Foundation**, the **Minnesota State Arts Board**, the **Forum of Regional Arts Councils of Minnesota**, **Target**, the **Bush Foundation**, **Mardag Foundation**, and **Jerome Foundation** with in-kind support from the **Minnesota Historical Society** and others.

We hope that arts advocates, legislators, local governments and others will use these reports to find new ways to improve their lives and local economies with the arts and culture.

The rest of *Creative Minnesota* and other research about Minnesota's arts community can be found at: <u>creativemn.org</u>.

The Arts Mean Business By Robert L. Lynch, President and CEO, Americans for the Arts

America's artists and arts organizations live and work in every community from coast-to-coast fueling creativity, beautifying our cities, and improving our quality of life. In my travels across the country, business and government leaders often talk to me about the challenges of funding the arts amid shrinking resources and alongside other pressing needs. They worry about jobs and the economy. Is their region a magnet for attracting and retaining a skilled and innovative workforce? How well are they competing in the high-stakes race to attract new businesses? The findings from *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* send a clear and welcome message: leaders who care about community and economic vitality can feel good about choosing to invest in the arts.

Arts & Economic Prosperity IV is our fourth study of the nonprofit arts and culture industry's impact on the economy. The most comprehensive study of its kind ever conducted, it features customized findings on 182 study regions representing all 50 states and the District of Columbia as well as estimates of economic impact nationally. Despite the economic headwinds that our country faced in 2010, the results are impressive. Nationally, the industry generated \$135.2 billion in total economic activity-\$61.1 billion by the nation's nonprofit arts and culture organizations in addition to \$74.1 billion in event-related expenditures by their audiences. This economic activity supports 4.1 million full-time jobs. Our industry also generates \$22.3 billion in revenue to local, state, and federal governments every year-a yield well beyond their collective \$4 billion in arts allocations.

Arts and culture organizations are resilient and entrepreneurial businesses. They employ people locally, purchase goods and services from within the community, and market and promote their regions. Arts organizations are rooted locally; these are jobs that cannot be shipped overseas. Like most industries, the Great Recession left a measurable financial impact on the arts-erasing the gains made during the pre-recession years, and leaving 2010 expenditures three percent behind their 2005 levels. The biggest effect of the recession was on attendance and audience spending. Inevitably, as people lost jobs and worried about losing their houses, arts attendancelike attendance to sports events and leisure travelwaned as well. Yet, even in a down economy, some communities saw an increase in their arts spending and employment. As the economy rebounds, the arts are well poised for growth. They are already producing new and exciting work-performances and exhibitions and festivals that entertain, inspire, and attract audiences.

Arts & Economic Prosperity IV shows that arts and culture organizations leverage additional event-related spending by their audiences that pumps revenue into the local economy. When patrons attend an arts event they may pay for parking, eat dinner at a restaurant, shop in local retail stores, and have dessert on the way home. Based on the 151,802 audience-intercept surveys conducted for this study, the typical arts attendee spends \$24.60 per person, per event, beyond the cost of admission.

Communities that draw cultural tourists experience an additional boost of economic activity. Tourism industry research has repeatedly demonstrated that arts tourists stay longer and spend more than the average traveler. *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* reflects those findings: 32 percent of attendees live outside the county in which the arts event took place, and their event-related spending is more than twice that of their local counterparts (nonlocal: \$39.96 vs. local: \$17.42). The message is clear: a vibrant arts community not only keeps residents and their discretionary spending close to home, it also attracts visitors who spend money and help local businesses thrive.

Arts & Economic Prosperity IV demonstrates that America's arts industry is not only resilient in times of economic uncertainty, but also a key component to our nation's economic recovery and future prosperity. Business and elected leaders need not feel that a choice must be made between arts funding and economic prosperity. This study proves that they can choose both. Nationally, as well as locally, **the arts mean business**. "The economic impacts of the arts in Minnesota are very important; their contributions to the quality of people's lives are priceless. Arts organizations are strongly supported throughout Minnesota, and they help make successful communities. Their continuing growth and vitality will be critical to our state's economic and social well-being."

-Minnesota Governor Mark Dayton

"In the last twenty five years, I have seen the arts in the Arrowhead region grow from primarily an urban based arts center to an active arts community region wide. There are artists and arts groups living and working in every county and legislative district in the Arrowhead region. I am excited to see the substantial economic impact that they have had on the region. The arts are a major contributor to the revitalization of rural Minnesota."

-Bob DeArmond, Executive Director,

Arrowhead Regional Arts Council

The Economic Impact of the Nonprofit Arts and Culture Industry in the City of Duluth, MN

Arts & Economic Prosperity IV provides compelling new evidence that the nonprofit arts and culture are a significant industry in the City of Duluth—one that generates \$36 million in total economic activity. This spending—\$14.3 million by nonprofit arts and culture organizations and an additional \$21.7 million in event-related spending by their audiences—supports 922 full-time equivalent jobs, generates \$21.9 million in household income to local residents, and delivers \$3.7 million in local and state government revenue. This economic impact study sends a strong signal that when we support the arts, we not only enhance our quality of life, but we also invest in the City of Duluth's economic well-being.

In 2012, Americans for the Arts published Arts & Economic Prosperity IV, the most comprehensive study of its kind ever conducted. It documented the economic impact of the nonprofit arts and culture sector in 139 cities and counties, 31 multi-city or multicounty regions, 10 states, and two individual arts districts-representing all 50 U.S. states and the District of Columbia. The diverse study regions ranged in population (1,600 to four million) and type (rural to large urban). Project economists customized inputoutput models to calculate specific and reliable findings for each study region. This study focused solely on the economic impact of nonprofit arts and culture organizations and event-related spending by their audiences. Spending by individual artists and the for-profit arts and culture sector were excluded.

This report presents the findings of a new study to evaluate the economic impact of the nonprofit arts and culture industry in the City of Duluth. The methodology used is identical to the national study, providing results that can be compared to those of the 182 national study participants.

Defining Economic Impact

This proprietary study uses four economic measures to define economic impact: full-time equivalent jobs, resident household income, and revenues generated for local and state government sources.

(1) Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) Jobs describes the total amount of labor employed. Economists measure FTE jobs, not the total number of employees, because it is a more accurate measure that accounts for part-time employment.

(2) Resident Household Income (often called Personal Income) includes salaries, wages, and entrepreneurial income paid to local residents. It is the money residents earn and use to pay for food, mortgages, and other living expenses.

Revenue to (3) Local and (4) State Government includes revenue from local and state taxes (e.g., income, property, sales, and lodging) as well as funds from license fees, utility fees, filing fees, and other similar sources.

Economic Impact of the ENTIRE Nonprofit Arts and Culture Industry (Combined Spending by Both Organizations <u>and</u> Their Audiences) in the City of Duluth, MN

During fiscal year 2013, aggregate nonprofit sector spending by both the City of Duluth's nonprofit arts and culture organizations and their audiences totaled \$36 million. The table below shows the total economic impact of this spending.

TOTAL Economic Impact of the Nonprofit Arts and Culture Organ		· ·	
	City of Duluth	Median of Similar Study Regions Pop. = 50,000 to 99,999	
Direct Expenditures	\$36,026,369	\$10,872,627	
Full-Time Equivalent Jobs	922	489	
Resident Household Income	\$21,905,000	\$9,770,000	
Local Government Revenue	\$779,000	\$438,000	
State Government Revenue	\$2,968,000	\$519,000	

Direct and Indirect Economic Impact: How a Dollar is Re-spent in the Economy

Arts & Economic Prosperity IV uses a sophisticated economic analysis called input-output analysis to measure economic impact. It is a system of mathematical equations that combines statistical methods and economic theory. Input-output analysis enables economists to track how many times a dollar is "re-spent" within the local economy, and the economic impact generated by each round of spending. How can a dollar be re-spent? Consider the following example:

A theater company in the City of Duluth purchases several gallons of paint from a local hardware store for \$200. The hardware store then uses a portion of the \$200 to pay the sales clerk; the sales clerk re-spends some of the money at a grocery store; the grocery store uses some to pay its cashier; the cashier spends some on rent; and so on ...

Thus, the initial expenditure by the theater company was followed by four additional rounds of local spending (by the hardware store, the sales clerk, the grocery store, and the cashier).

- The economic impact of the theater company's initial \$200 expenditure is the <u>direct</u> economic impact.
- The economic impacts of the subsequent rounds of local spending are the <u>indirect</u> and <u>induced</u> impacts.
- Eventually, the \$200 dollars will "leak out" of the local economy (i.e., be spent non-locally) and cease to have a local economic impact. In this example, if the theater company purchased the paint from a non-local hardware store there would be no local economic impact. Since the hardware store is located in the Arrowhead Region, the dollars remain within the regional economy and create at least one more round of regional spending by the hardware company.
- The total impact is the sum of the direct impact plus all indirect impacts. This report provides the total impact.

A dollar "ripples" very differently through each region, which is why a customized input-output model was created for the Arrowhead Region (defined as Aitkin, Carlton, Cook, Itasca, Koochiching, Lake, and Saint Louis Counties).

"Like other entrepreneurs and small business owners, artists add significant economic and creative value across the entire state. Backed by hard data, *Creative Minnesota* reveals important truths about how our state's artists and arts and culture organizations are making dynamic contributions to our economic vitality and to our high quality of life."

> - Kate Wolford, President, The McKnight Foundation

Economic Impact of Spending by Nonprofit Arts and Culture ORGANIZATIONS in the City of Duluth, MN

Nonprofit arts and culture organizations are active contributors to their business community. They are employers, producers, and consumers. They are members of the Chamber of Commerce as well as key partners in the marketing and promotion of their cities, regions, and states. Spending by nonprofit arts and culture organizations totaled \$14.3 million in the City of Duluth during fiscal year 2013. This spending is far-reaching: organizations pay employees, purchase supplies, contract for services, and acquire assets within their community. These actions, in turn, support jobs, create household income, and generate revenue to the local and state governments.

The City of Duluth's nonprofit arts and culture organizations provide rewarding employment for more than just administrators, artists, curators, choreographers, and musicians. They also employ financial staff, facility managers, and salespeople. In addition, the spending by these organizations directly supports a wide array of other occupations spanning many industries (e.g., printing, event planning, legal, construction, and accounting).

Data were collected from 37 eligible nonprofit arts and culture organizations in the City of Duluth, including detailed budget information about more than 40 expenditure categories for fiscal year 2013 (e.g., labor, payments to local and nonlocal artists, operations, administration, programming, facilities, and capital expenditures/asset acquisition). The following table shows the total economic impact of their aggregate spending.

in the City of Duluth			
	City of Duluth	Median of Similar Study Regions <i>Pop. = 50,000 to 99,999</i>	
Direct Expenditures	\$14,291,391	\$6,245,874	
Full-Time Equivalent Jobs	466	231	
Resident Household Income	\$10,323,000	\$6,234,000	
Local Government Revenue	\$237,000	\$234,000	
State Government Revenue	\$1,057,000	\$239,000	

TOTAL Economic Impact of Spending by Nonprofit Arts and Culture ORGANIZATIONS in the City of Duluth

An Economic Impact Beyond Dollars: Volunteerism

While arts volunteers may not have an economic impact as defined in this study, they clearly have an enormous impact by helping the City of Duluth's nonprofit arts and culture organizations function as a viable industry. *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* reveals a significant contribution to nonprofit arts and culture organizations as a result of volunteerism. During 2013, a total of 1,949 volunteers donated a total of 73,542 hours to the City of Duluth's 37 participating nonprofit arts and culture organizations. This represents a donation of time with an estimated aggregate value of \$1,658,372 (Independent Sector estimated the dollar value of the average 2013 volunteer hour to be \$22.55).

The 37 participating organizations reported an average of 52.7 volunteers, who volunteered an average of 37.7 hours each—resulting in approximately 1,987.6 hours of unpaid labor contributed to each organization.

The Value of In-Kind Contributions to Arts Organizations

The participating organizations were asked about the sources and value of their in-kind support. In-kind contributions are non-cash donations such as materials (e.g., office supplies from a local retailer), facilities (e.g., rent), and services (e.g., printing costs from a local printer). The 37 participating nonprofit arts and culture organizations in the City of Duluth reported that they received in-kind contributions with an aggregate value of \$234,617 during fiscal year 2013. These contributions are typically received from a variety of sources that can include corporations, individuals, local and state arts organizations, and government agencies.

"The arts, including music and theatre, have long been established economic entities in Northern Minnesota. It is a reflection of the diverse ethnic nationalities and culture of hard work that make us a unique and progressive region."

-Minnesota State Representative Tom Anzelc

Economic Impact of Spending by Nonprofit Arts and Culture AUDIENCES in the City of Duluth, MN

The nonprofit arts and culture industry, unlike most industries, leverages a significant amount of event-related spending by its audiences. For example, when patrons attend a cultural event, they may pay to park their car, purchase dinner at a restaurant, shop in nearby stores, eat dessert after the show, and pay a babysitter upon their return home. Attendees from out of town may spend the night in a hotel. This spending generates related commerce for local businesses such as restaurants, parking garages, retail stores, and hotels.

To measure the impact of nonprofit arts and culture audiences in the City of Duluth, data were collected from 225 attendees to cultural events that took place in the Arrowhead Region during calendar year 2014. Researchers used an audience-intercept methodology, a standard technique in which patrons complete a written survey about their event-related spending while attending the event. In the Arrowhead Region, arts attendees spend an average of \$23.99 per person, per event as a direct result of their attendance to the event. Local businesses that cater to arts and culture audiences reap the rewards of this economic activity.

The City of Duluth's 37 participating nonprofit arts and culture organizations reported that the aggregate attendance to their events was 835,898 during 2013. These attendees spent an estimated total of \$21.7 million, excluding the cost of event admission. The following table demonstrate the total impacts of this spending.

TOTAL Essential Impact of Sponding by Nonpusit Arts and Culture AUDIENCES

	City of Duluth	Median of Similar Study Regions <i>Pop. = 50,000 to 99,999</i>	
Direct Expenditures	\$21,734,978	\$6,076,502	
Full-Time Equivalent Jobs	456	206	
Resident Household Income	\$11,582,000	\$4,235,000	
Local Government Revenue	\$542,000	\$287,000	
State Government Revenue	\$1,911,000	\$362,000	

^{*} Why exclude the cost of admission? The admissions paid by attendees are excluded from the analysis because those dollars are captured in the operating budgets of the participating nonprofit arts and culture organizations and, in turn, are spent by the organization. This methodology avoids "double-counting" those dollars in the study analysis.

Cultural Tourists Spend More

The 225 audience survey respondents were asked to provide the ZIP code of their primary residence, enabling researchers to determine which attendees were regional residents (live <u>within</u> the Arrowhead Region) and which were non-residents (live <u>outside</u> the Arrowhead Region). Based on these survey responses, researchers estimate that 75.5 percent of the City of Duluth's 835,898 nonprofit arts attendees were residents of the Arrowhead Region and 24.5 percent were non-residents of the Arrowhead Region. Non-resident attendees spend an average of 126 percent more per person than local attendees (\$44.96 vs. \$19.85) as a result of their attendance to cultural events. As would be expected from a traveler, higher spending was typically found in the categories of lodging, meals, and transportation. When a community attracts cultural tourists, it harnesses significant economic rewards.

Event-Related Spending by Arts and Culture Event Attendees Totaled \$21.7 million in the City of Duluth (<u>ex</u> cluding the cost of event admission)			
	Residents of the Arrowhead Region	Non-Residents of the Arrowhead Region	All City of Duluth Event Attendees
Total Attendance	631,103	204,795	835,898
Percent of Attendees	75.5%	24.5%	100.0%%
Average Dollars Spent Per Attendee	\$19.85	\$44.96	\$23.99
Direct Event-Related Expenditures	\$12,527,395	\$9,207,583	\$21,734,978

Nonprofit Arts and Culture Event Attendees Spend an Average of \$23.99 Per Person in the City of Duluth (excluding the cost of event admission)			
	Residents	Non-Residents	All City of Duluth Event Attendees
Refreshments/Snacks During Event	\$0.95	\$0.80	\$0.92
Meals Before/After Event	\$9.86	\$12.73	\$10.33
Souvenirs and Gifts	\$5.16	\$5.43	\$5.21
Clothing and Accessories	\$0.59	\$0.22	\$0.53
Ground Transportation	\$2.45	\$7.14	\$3.23
Event-Related Child Care	\$0.39	\$0.00	\$0.33
Overnight Lodging (one night only)	\$0.18	\$18.44	\$3.18
Other	\$0.27	\$0.20	\$0.26
Total Per Person Spending	\$19.85	\$44.96	\$23.99

Cultural Events Attract New Dollars and Retain Local Dollars

The City of Duluth's nonprofit arts and culture sector provides attractions that draw visitors to the region. In fact, 22.2 percent of the Arrowhead Region's non-resident audience survey respondents reported that the primary reason for their trip was "specifically to attend this arts/cultural event."

In addition, 35.1 percent of the non-resident survey respondents reported that they will spend at least one night away from home in the Arrowhead Region as a direct result of attending the cultural event. Non-resident attendees who stay overnight in paid lodging spend an average of \$88.37 per person as a result of their attendance— significantly more than the overall per person average of \$44.96 for all non-resident attendees.

Finally, the audience survey respondents were asked, "If this event were not happening, would you have traveled to another community to attend a similar cultural experience?"

- 32.8 percent of the Arrowhead Region's <u>resident</u> cultural attendees report that *they would have traveled to a different community in order to attend a similar cultural experience.*
- 32.4 percent of the Arrowhead Region's <u>non-resident</u> cultural attendees report *the same*.

These figures demonstrate the economic impact of the nonprofit arts and culture in the purest sense. If a community does not provide a variety of artistic and cultural experiences, it will fail to attract the new dollars of cultural tourists. It will also lose the discretionary spending of its local residents who will travel elsewhere to experience the arts.

"The arts play a crucial role in strengthening the economies in our rural region. Not only do arts and culture promote tourism and education, but they enhance the quality of life for our community members."

- Minnesota State Senator Tom Saxhaug

Many Cultural Attendees are Artists, Too!

• 60.6 percent of the Arrowhead Region's cultural audiences report that they actively participate in the creation of the arts (e.g., sing in a choir, play an instrument, act in a community play, paint or draw).

Conclusion

The nonprofit arts and culture are a \$36 million industry in the City of Duluth—one that supports 922 full-time equivalent jobs and generates \$3.7 million in local and state government revenue. Nonprofit arts and culture organizations, which spend \$14.3 million annually, leverage \$21.7 million in additional spending by arts and culture audiences—spending that pumps vital revenue into local restaurants, hotels, retail stores, parking garages, and other businesses. By demonstrating that investing in the arts and culture yields economic benefits, *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* lays to rest a common misconception: that communities support the arts and culture at the expense of local economic development. In fact, they are investing in an industry that supports jobs, generates government revenue, and is a cornerstone of tourism. This report shows conclusively that **the arts mean business in the City of Duluth!**

"Disney has a rich legacy in animation, film and storytelling, so naturally we consider the arts to be an essential part of our business, as well as an essential element of our communities. We have seen how the arts not only enrich American life, but also support millions of jobs across the country, generate billions of dollars in economic impact, and help drive the family-vacation industry. By investing in the arts, we plant seeds for the future and make our communities better places to live."

- Meg Crofton, President

Walt Disney World Parks & Resorts Operations, U.S. and France

"Many, if not most Minnesotans value the statewide scope and local and national significance of the arts in Minnesota. What is less discussed is the economic impact of the arts. Annually, nearly 20 million people (including many visitors to our state) attend arts performances and events here. That relationship directly helps employ well over 30,000 people while directly creating related opportunities for things like hundreds of thousands of dollars in restaurant sales. In addition to inspiring and entertaining, the arts are also one of the most important contributors to Minnesota's continued post-recession economic growth. "

- Minnesota State Senator **Richard Cohen** Chair of the Senate Finance Committee and Subcommittee on Legacy

"As a past and current chair of the Legacy Committee in the Minnesota House of Representatives it has been my pleasure to witness the impact of appropriations from Legacy Amendment funding on our economy. In Greater Minnesota our libraries and historical societies have certainly benefited. But in a larger sense money for the arts has spurred local projects throughout central and southwestern Minnesota. Certainly there have been immediate economic results, but long term I see even more significant impact. I'm aware of restoration of historic buildings that are intended to eventually become local art centers. We have just touched the surface of the legacy amendment's future possibilities for economic growth."

- Minnesota State Representative **Dean Urdahl**, Chair of the House Legacy Committee

The Arts & Economic Prosperity IV Calculator

To make it easier to compare the different organizations within the City of Duluth (and the Arrowhead Region), the project researchers calculated the economic impact per \$100,000 of direct spending by nonprofit arts and culture organizations and their audiences.

Economic Impact Per \$100,000 of Direct Spending by ORGANIZATIONS

For every \$100,000 in direct spending by a nonprofit arts and culture organization in the City of Duluth, there was the following total economic impact.

TABLE 1:

Ratios of Economic Impact Per \$100,000 of Direct Spending by Nonprofit Arts and Culture <u>Organizations</u> in the City of Duluth

	City of Duluth	Median of Similar Study Regions Pop. = 50,000 to 99,999	National Median
Full-Time Equivalent Jobs	3.26	3.70	3.46
Resident Household Income	\$72,233	\$84,132	\$82,084
Local Government Revenue	\$1,660	\$3,489	\$3,819
State Government Revenue	\$7,394	\$4,109	\$4,656

An Example of How to Use the Organizational Spending Calculator Table (above):

An administrator from a nonprofit arts and culture organization that has total expenditures of \$250,000 wants to determine the organization's total economic impact on full-time equivalent (FTE) employment in the City of Duluth. The administrator would:

- 1. Determine the amount spent by the nonprofit arts and culture organization;
- 2. Divide the total expenditure by 100,000; and
- 3. Multiply that figure by the FTE employment ratio per \$100,000 for the City of Duluth.

Thus, \$250,000 divided by 100,000 equals 2.5; 2.5 times 3.26 (from the top row of data on Table 1 above) equals a total of 8.2 full-time equivalent jobs supported (both directly and indirectly) within the City of Duluth by that nonprofit arts and culture organization. Using the same procedure, the estimate can be calculated for resident household income as well as for local and state government revenue.

Economic Impact Per \$100,000 of Direct Spending by AUDIENCES

The economic impact of event-related spending by arts audiences can also be derived for individual or groups of nonprofit arts and culture organizations and events in the City of Duluth.

The first step is to determine the total estimated event-related spending by arts and culture event attendees (excluding the cost of admission). To derive this figure, multiply the average per person event-related expenditure in the Arrowhead Region by the total event attendance. The ratios of economic impact per \$100,000 in direct spending can then be used to determine the total economic impact of the total estimated audience spending.

TABLE 2: Average Per Person Event-Related Spending by All Arts and Culture Event Attendees in the City of Duluth (excluding the cost of event admission) Average of **Similar Study Regions City of Duluth** *Pop.* = 50,000 to 99,999 National Average Refreshments/Snacks During Event \$0.92 \$2.14 \$3.02 Meals Before/After Event \$10.33 \$7.77 \$10.12 Souvenirs and Gifts \$5.21 \$2.05 \$2.74 Clothing and Accessories \$0.53 \$1.05 \$1.31 Ground Transportation \$3.23 \$2.03 \$2.65 Event-Related Child Care \$0.33 \$0.26 \$0.36 Overnight Lodging (one night only) \$3.18 \$2.73 \$3.51 \$0.70 Other \$0.26 \$0.89 \$23.99 \$20.31 **Total Per Person Spending** \$24.60

TABLE 3:

Ratios of Economic Impact Per \$100,000 of Direct Spending by Nonprofit Arts and Culture <u>Audiences</u> in the City of Duluth

	City of Duluth	Median of Similar Study Regions Pop. = 50,000 to 99,999	National Median
Full-Time Equivalent Jobs	2.10	2.77	2.69
Resident Household Income	\$53,286	\$60,371	\$57,140
Local Government Revenue	\$2,492	\$5,241	\$5,100
State Government Revenue	\$8,790	\$5,677	\$5,802

An Example of How to Use the Audience Spending Calculator Tables (on the preceding page):

An administrator wants to determine the total economic impact of the 25,000 total attendees to his/her organization's nonprofit arts and culture events on full-time equivalent (FTE) employment in the City of Duluth. The administrator would:

- 1. Determine the total estimated audience spending by multiplying the average per person expenditure for the Arrowhead Region by the total attendance to nonprofit arts and culture events;
- 2. Divide the resulting total estimated audience spending by 100,000; and
- 3. Multiply that figure by the FTE employment ratio per \$100,000 for the City of Duluth.

Thus, 25,000 times \$23.99 (from the bottom row of data on Table 2 on the preceding page) equals \$599,750; \$599,750 divided by 100,000 equals 6.00; 6.00 times 2.10 (from the top row of data on Table 3 on the preceding page) equals a total of 12.6 full-time equivalent jobs supported (both directly and indirectly) within the City of Duluth by that nonprofit arts and culture organization. Using the same procedure, the estimate can be calculated for resident household income and local and state government revenue.

Making Comparisons with Similar Study Regions

For the purpose of this customized research report, the analyzed region is defined as the City of Duluth. According to the most recent data available from the United States Census Bureau, the population of the City of Duluth was estimated to be 86,238 during 2014. Audience surveys were collected from attendees to cultural events that took place in the Arrowhead Region (defined as Aitkin, Carlton, Cook, Itasca, Koochiching, Lake, and Saint Louis Counties). For comparison purposes, more than 300 pages of detailed data tables containing the study results for all 182 study regions that participated in the 2012 *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* national study can be found in Appendix B of the National Statistical Report. The data tables are stratified by population, making it easy to compare the findings for the City of Duluth to the findings for similarly populated study regions (as well as any other participating study regions that are considered valid comparison cohorts).

All of the national study publications are available both by download (free) and hardcopy (for purchase) at www.AmericansForTheArts.org/EconomicImpact.

"The success of my family's business depends on finding and cultivating a creative and innovative workforce. I have witnessed firsthand the power of the arts in building these business skills. When we participate personally in the arts, we strengthen our 'creativity muscles,' which makes us not just a better ceramicist or chorus member, but a more creative worker—better able to identify challenges and innovative business solutions. This is one reason why the arts remain an important part of my personal and corporate philanthropy."

- Christopher Forbes, Vice Chairman, Forbes, Inc.

About This Study

The *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* study was conducted by Americans for the Arts to document the economic impact of the nonprofit arts and culture industry in 182 communities and regions (139 cities and counties, 31 multi-city or multi-county regions, 10 states, and two individual arts districts)—representing all 50 U.S. states and the District of Columbia.

The diverse communities range in population (1,600 to four million) and type (rural to urban). The study focuses solely on nonprofit arts and culture organizations and their audiences. Public arts councils and public presenting facilities/institutions are included, as are select programs embedded within another organization (that have their own budget and play a substantial role in the cultural life of the community). The study excludes spending by individual artists and the for-profit arts and entertainment sector (e.g., Broadway or the motion picture industry). Detailed expenditure data were collected from 9,721 arts and culture organizations and 151,802 of their attendees. The project economists, from the Georgia Institute of Technology, customized inputoutput analysis models for each study region to provide specific and reliable economic impact data about their nonprofit arts and culture industry, specifically full-time equivalent jobs, household income, and local and state government revenue.

The 182 Local, Regional, and Statewide Study Partners

Americans for the Arts published a Call for Participants in 2010 seeking communities interested in participating in the *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* study. Of the more than 200 potential partners that expressed interest, 182 agreed to participate and complete four participation criteria: (1) identify and code the universe of nonprofit arts and culture organizations in their study region; (2) assist researchers with the collection of detailed financial and attendance data from those organizations; (3) conduct audience-intercept surveys at cultural events; and (4) pay a modest cost-sharing fee (no community was refused participation for an inability to pay).

Minnesota Citizens for the Arts contracted with Americans for the Arts to conduct a separate economic impact analysis focused solely on the nonprofit arts and culture industry in the City of Duluth. The methodology used is identical to the national study methodology, making it possible to compare the results for the City of Duluth with those of the national study participants.

Surveys of ORGANIZATIONS

Each of the 182 study regions attempted to identify its comprehensive universe of nonprofit arts and culture organizations using the Urban Institute's National Taxonomy of Exempt Entity (NTEE) coding system as a guideline. The NTEE system developed by the National Center for Charitable Statistics at the Urban Institute—is a definitive classification system for nonprofit organizations recognized as tax exempt by the Internal Revenue Code. This system divides the entire universe of nonprofit organizations into 10 Major categories, including "Arts, Culture, and Humanities." The Urban Institute reports that 113,000 nonprofit arts and culture organizations were registered with the IRS in 2010, up from 94,450 in 2005.

The following NTEE "Arts, Culture, and Humanities" subcategories were included:

- A01 Alliances and Advocacy
- A02 Management and Technical Assistance
- A03 Professional Societies and Associations
- A05 Research Institutes and Public Policy Analysis
- A11 Single Organization Support
- A12 Fund Raising and Fund Distribution
- A19 Support (not elsewhere classified)
- A20 Arts and Culture (general)
- A23 Cultural and Ethnic Awareness
- A24 Folk Arts
- A25 Arts Education
- A26 Arts and Humanities Councils and Agencies
- A27 Community Celebrations
- A30 Media and Communications (general)
- A31 Film and Video
- A32 Television
- A33 Printing and Publishing
- A34 Radio
- A40 Visual Arts (general)
- A50 Museums (general)
- A51 Art Museums
- A52 Children's Museums
- A53 Folk Arts Museums
- A54 History Museums
- A56 Natural History and Natural Science Museums
- A57 Science and Technology Museums
- A60 Performing Arts (general)
- A61 Performing Arts Centers
- A62 Dance
- A63 Ballet
- A65 Theatre
- A68 Music
- A69 Symphony Orchestras
- A6A Opera
- A6B Singing and Choral Groups
- A6C Bands and Ensembles
- A6E Performing Arts Schools
- A70 Humanities (general)
- A80 Historical Organizations (general)
- A82 Historical Societies and Historic Preservation
- A84 Commemorative Events
- A90 Arts Services (general)
- A99 Arts, Culture, and Humanities (miscellaneous)

In addition, the study partners were encouraged to include other types of eligible organizations if they play a substantial role in the cultural life of the community or if their primary purpose is to promote participation in, appreciation for, and understanding of the visual, performing, folk, and media arts. These include government-owned or government-operated cultural facilities and institutions, municipal arts agencies and councils, private community arts organizations, unincorporated arts groups, living collections (such as zoos, aquariums, and botanical gardens), university presenters, and arts programs that are embedded under the umbrella of a non-arts organization or facility (such as a community center or church). In short, if it displays the characteristics of a nonprofit arts and culture organization, it is included. For-profit businesses and individual artists were excluded from this study.

Nationally, detailed information was collected from 9,721 eligible organizations about their fiscal year 2010 expenditures in more than 40 expenditure categories (e.g., labor, local and non-local artists, operations, materials, facilities, and asset acquisition) as well as about their event attendance, in-kind contributions, and volunteerism. Responding organizations had budgets ranging from a low of \$0 to a high of \$239.7 million. Response rates for the 182 communities averaged 43.2 percent and ranged from 5.3 percent to 100 percent. It is important to note that each study region's results are based solely on the actual survey data collected. No estimates have been made to account for non-respondents. Therefore, the less-than-100 percent response rates suggest an understatement of the economic impact findings in most of the individual study regions.

In the City of Duluth, all 37 of the total eligible nonprofit arts and culture organizations identified by Minnesota Citizens for the Arts participated in this study—an overall participation rate of 100.0 percent. The Minnesota Cultural Data Project (CDP) was the primary source of information about the universe of eligible organizations. The CDP data were supplemented using both data collected through a proprietary web-based survey process as well as grant application data. The most recently-available financial and attendance data were used for each of the 37 participating organizations in this analysis. In most cases, the most recently-available data are from fiscal year 2013 (the organization's fiscal year that ended between January 1 and December 31, 2013). In some cases, however, data were used from fiscal year 2012 or earlier.

Surveys of AUDIENCES

Audience-intercept surveying, a common and accepted research method, was conducted in all 182 of the study regions to measure event-related spending by nonprofit arts and culture audiences. Patrons were asked to complete a short survey while attending an event. Nationally, a total of 151,802 valid and usable surveys were completed for an average of 834 surveys per study region. The randomly selected respondents provided itemized expenditure data on attendance-related activities such as meals, souvenirs, transportation, and lodging. Data were collected throughout 2011 (to guard against seasonal spikes or drop-offs in attendance) as well as at a broad range of both paid and free events (a night at the opera will typically yield more spending than a weekend children's theater production or a free community music festival, for example). The survey respondents provided information about the entire party with whom they were attending the event. With an overall average travel party size of 2.69 people, these data actually represent the spending patterns of more than 408,000 attendees.

A total of 225 valid audience-intercept surveys were collected from attendees to arts and culture performances, events, and exhibits that took place in the Arrowhead Region during 2014.

Economic Analysis

A common theory of community growth is that an area must export goods and services if it is to prosper economically. This theory is called economic-base theory, and it depends on dividing the economy into two sectors: the export sector and the local sector. Exporters, such as automobile manufacturers, hotels, and department stores, obtain income from customers outside of the community. This "export income" then enters the economy in the form of salaries, purchases of materials, dividends, and so forth, and becomes income to local residents. Much of it is re-spent locally; some, however, is spent for goods imported from outside of the community. The dollars re-spent locally have an economic impact as they continue to circulate through the economy. This theory applies to arts organizations as well as to other producers.

The Input-Output Process

To derive the most reliable economic impact data, input-output analysis is used to measure the impact of expenditures by nonprofit arts and culture organizations and their audiences. This is a highly regarded type of economic analysis that has been the basis for two Nobel Prizes. The models are systems of mathematical equations that combine statistical methods and economic theory in an area of study called econometrics. They trace how many times a dollar is re-spent within the local economy before it leaks out, and it quantifies the economic impact of each round of spending. This form of economic analysis is well suited for this study because it can be customized specifically to each study region.

To complete the analysis for the City of Duluth, project economists customized an input-output model based on the local dollar flow between 533 finely detailed industries within the regional economy that includes the Arrowhead Region (defined as including Aitkin, Carlton, Cook, Itasca, Koochiching, Lake, and Saint Louis Counties). This was accomplished by using detailed data on employment, incomes, and government revenues provided by the U.S. Department of Commerce (County Business Patterns, the Regional Economic Information System, and the Survey of State and Local Finance) and local tax data (sales taxes, property taxes, and miscellaneous local option taxes), as well as the survey data from the responding nonprofit arts and culture organizations and their audiences.

The input-output model is based on a table of 533 finely detailed industries showing local sales and purchases. The local and state economy of each community is researched so the table can be customized for each community. The basic purchase patterns for local industries are derived from a similar table for the U.S. economy for 2007 (the latest detailed data available from the U.S. Department of Commerce). The table is first reduced to reflect the unique size and industry mix of the local economy, based on data from County Business Patterns and the Regional Economic Information System of the U.S. Department of Commerce. It is then adjusted so that only transactions with local businesses are recorded in the inter-industry part of the table. This technique compares supply and demand and estimates the additional imports or exports required to make total supply equal total demand. The resulting table shows the detailed sales and purchase patterns of the local industries. The 533-industry table is then aggregated to reflect the general activities of 32 industries plus local households, creating a total of 33 industries. To trace changes in the economy, each column is converted to show the direct requirements per dollar of gross output for each sector. This direct-requirements table represents the "recipe" for producing the output of each industry.

The economic impact findings were computed using what is called an "iterative" procedure. This process uses the sum of a power series to approximate the solution to the economic model. This is what it looks like in matrix algebra:

 $\mathbf{T} = \mathbf{I}\mathbf{X} + \mathbf{A}\mathbf{X} + \mathbf{A}\mathbf{2}\mathbf{X} + \mathbf{A}\mathbf{3}\mathbf{X} + \dots + \mathbf{A}\mathbf{n}\mathbf{X}.$

T is the solution, a column vector of changes in each industry's outputs caused by the changes represented in the column vector X. A is the 33 by 33 directrequirements matrix. This equation is used to trace the direct expenditures attributable to nonprofit arts organizations and their audiences. A multiplier effect table is produced that displays the results of this equation. The total column is T. The initial expenditure to be traced is IX (I is the identity matrix, which is operationally equivalent to the number 1 in ordinary algebra). Round 1 is AX, the result of multiplying the matrix A by the vector X (the outputs required of each supplier to produce the goods and services purchased in the initial change under study). Round 2 is A2X, which is the result of multiplying the matrix A by Round 1 (it answers the same question applied to Round 1: "What are the outputs required of each supplier to produce the goods and services purchased in Round 1 of this chain of events?"). Each of columns 1 through 12 in the multiplier effects table represents one of the elements in the continuing but diminishing chain of expenditures on the right side of the equation. Their sum, T, represents the total production required in the local economy in response to arts activities.

Calculation of the total impact of the nonprofit arts on the outputs of other industries (T) can now be converted to impacts on the final incomes to local residents by multiplying the outputs produced by the ratios of household income to output and employment to output. Thus, the employment impact of changes in outputs due to arts expenditures is calculated by multiplying elements in the column of total outputs by the ratio of employment to output for the 32 industries in the region. Changes in household incomes, local government revenues, and state government revenues due to nonprofit arts expenditures are similarly transformed.

A comprehensive description of the methodology used to complete the national study is available at www.AmericansForTheArts.org/EconomicImpact.

Frequently Used Terms

This section provides a glossary of economic impact terminology.

Cultural Tourism

Travel directed toward experiencing the arts, heritage, and special character of a place.

Direct Economic Impact

A measure of the economic effect of the initial expenditure within a community. For example, when the symphony pays its players, each musician's salary, the associated government taxes, and full-time equivalent employment status represent the direct economic impact.

Direct Expenditures

The first round of expenditures in the economic cycle. A paycheck from the symphony to the violin player and a ballet company's purchase of dance shoes are examples of direct expenditures.

Econometrics

The process of using statistical methods and economic theory to develop a system of mathematical equations that measures the flow of dollars between local industries. The input-output model developed for this study is an example of an econometric model.

Econometrician

An economist who designs, builds, and maintains econometric models.

Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) Jobs

A term that describes the total amount of labor employed. Economists measure FTE jobs—not the total number of employees—because it is a more accurate measure of total employment. It is a manager's discretion to hire one full-time employee, two half-time employees, four quarter-time employees, etc. Almost always, more people are affected than are reflected in the number of FTE jobs reported due to the abundance of part-time employment, especially in the nonprofit arts and culture industry.

Indirect Economic Impact

Each time a dollar changes hands, there is a measurable economic impact. When people and businesses receive money, they re-spend much of that money locally. Indirect impact measures the effect of this re-spending on jobs, household income, and revenue to local and state government. It is often referred to as secondary spending or the dollars "rippling" through a community. When funds are eventually spent non-locally, they are considered to have "leaked" out of the community and therefore cease to have a local economic impact. Indirect impact includes the impact of all rounds of spending (except for the initial expenditure) until the dollars have completely "leaked out" of the local economy.

Input-Output Analysis

A system of mathematical equations that combines statistical methods and economic theory in an area of economic study called econometrics. Economists use this model (occasionally called an inter-industry model) to measure how many times a dollar is re-spent in, or "ripples" through, a community before it "leaks out" of the local economy by being spent non-locally (see Leakage below). The model is based on a matrix that tracks the dollar flow between 533 finely detailed industries in each community. It allows researchers to determine the economic impact of local spending by nonprofit arts and culture organizations on jobs, household income, and government revenue.

Leakage

The money that community members spend outside of the local economy. This non-local spending has no economic impact within the community. A ballet company purchasing shoes from a non-local manufacturer is an example of leakage. If the shoe company were local, the expenditure would remain within the community and create another round of spending by the shoe company.

Multiplier (often called Economic Activity Multiplier)

An estimate of the number of times that a dollar changes hands within the community before it leaks out of the community (for example, the theater pays the actor, the actor spends money at the grocery store, the grocery store pays its cashier, and so on). This estimate is quantified as one number by which all expenditures are multiplied. For example, if the arts are a \$10 million industry and a multiplier of three is used, then it is estimated that these arts organizations have a total economic impact of \$30 million. The convenience of a multiplier is that it is one simple number; its shortcoming, however, is its reliability. Users rarely note, however, that the multiplier is developed by making gross estimates of the industries within the local economy with no allowance for differences in the characteristics of those industries, usually resulting in an overestimation of the economic impact. In contrast, the input-output model employed in *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* is a type of economic analysis tailored specifically to each community and, as such, provides more reliable and specific economic impact results.

Resident Household Income (often called Personal Income)

The salaries, wages, and entrepreneurial income residents earn and use to pay for food, mortgages, and other living expenses. It is important to note that resident household income is not just salary. When a business receives money, for example, the owner usually takes a percentage of the profit, resulting in income for the owner.

Revenue to Local and State Government

Local and state government revenue is not derived exclusively from income, property, sales, and other taxes. It also includes license fees, utility fees, user fees, and filing fees. Local government revenue includes funds to city and county government, schools, and special districts.

Frequently Asked Questions

This section answers some common questions about this study and the methology used to complete it.

How were the eligible nonprofit arts organizations in each community selected?

Local partners attempted to identify their universe of nonprofit arts and culture organizations using the Urban Institute's National Taxonomy of Exempt Entity (NTEE) codes as a guideline. Eligible organizations included those whose primary purpose is to promote appreciation for and understanding of the visual, performing, folk, and media arts. Public arts councils, public presenting facilities or institutions, and embedded organizations that have their own budget also were included if they play a substantial role in the cultural life of the community. For-profit businesses and individual artists are excluded from this study.

What type of economic analysis was done to determine the study results?

An input-output analysis model was customized for each of the participating communities and regions to determine the local economic impact their nonprofit arts and culture organizations and arts audiences. Americans for the Arts, which conducted the research, worked with highly regarded economists to design the input-output model used for this study.

What other information was collected in addition to the arts surveys?

In addition to detailed expenditure data provided by the surveyed organizations, extensive wage, labor, tax, and commerce data were collected from local, state, and federal governments for use in the input-output model.

Why doesn't this study use a multiplier?

When many people hear about an economic impact study, they expect the result to be quantified in what is often called a multiplier or an economic activity multiplier. The economic activity multiplier is an estimate of the number of times a dollar changes hands within the community (e.g., a theater pays its actor, the actor spends money at the grocery store, the grocery store pays the cashier, and so on). It is quantified as one number by which expenditures are multiplied. The convenience of the multiplier is that it is one simple number. Users rarely note, however, that the multiplier is developed by making gross estimates of the industries within the local economy and does not allow for differences in the characteristics of those industries. Using an economic activity multiplier usually results in an overestimation of the economic impact and therefore lacks reliability.

Why are the admissions expenses excluded from the analysis of audience spending?

Researchers make the assumption that any admissions dollars paid by event attendees are typically collected as revenue for the organization that is presenting the event. The organization then spends those dollars. The admissions paid by audiences are excluded because those dollars are captured in the operating budgets of the participating nonprofit arts and culture organizations. This methodology avoids "double-counting" those dollars in the analysis.

How is the economic impact of arts and culture organizations different from other industries?

Any time money changes hands there is a measurable economic impact. Social service organizations, libraries, and all entities that spend money have an economic impact. What makes the economic impact of arts and culture organizations unique is that, unlike most other industries, they induce large amounts of related spending by their audiences. For example, when patrons attend a performing arts event, they may purchase dinner at a restaurant, eat dessert after the show, and return home and pay the baby-sitter. All of these expenditures have a positive and measurable impact on the economy.

Will my local legislators believe these results?

Yes, this study makes a strong argument to legislators, but you may need to provide them with some extra help. It will be up to the user of this report to educate the public about economic impact studies in general and the results of this study in particular. The user may need to explain (1) the study methodology used; (2) that economists created an input-output model for each community and region in the study; and (3) the difference between input-output analysis and a multiplier. The good news is that as the number of economic impact studies completed by arts organizations and other special interest areas increases, so does the sophistication of community leaders whose influence these studies are meant to affect. Today, most decision makers want to know what methodology is being used and how and where the data were gathered.

You can be confident that the input-output analysis used in this study is a highly regarded model in the field of economics (the basis of two Nobel Prizes in economics). However, as in any professional field, there is disagreement about procedures, jargon, and the best way to determine results. Ask 12 artists to define art and you may get 12 answers; expect the same of economists. You may meet an economist who believes that these studies should be done differently (for example, a cost-benefit analysis of the arts).

How can a community not participating in the Arts and Economic Prosperity IV study apply these results?

Because of the variety of communities studied and the rigor with which the *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* study was conducted, nonprofit arts and culture organizations located in communities that were not part of the study can estimate their local economic impact. Estimates can be derived by using the *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* Calculator (found at www.AmericansForTheArts.org/EconomicImpact). Additionally, users will find sample PowerPoint presentations, press releases, Opinion-Editorials (i.e., Op-Eds), and other strategies for proper application of their estimated economic impact data.

Acknowledgments

Minnesota Citizens for the Arts, the Arrowhead Regional Arts Council, the *Creative Minnesota* team, and Americans for the Arts express their gratitude to the many people and organizations who made *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV: The Economic Impact of Nonprofit Arts and Culture Organizations and Their Audiences in the State of Minnesota* possible and assisted in its coordination and production. Minnesota Citizens for the Arts served as the statewide project partner for this study, and as such worked closely to coordinate the local implementation of this customized study for the City of Duluth.

Creative Minnesota Team:

Chair and Project Manager:

Sheila Smith, Minnesota Citizens for the Arts*

Members:

Kate Barr, Nonprofits Assistance Fund* Vickie Benson, The McKnight Foundation* Sheila Brommel, Minnesota Historical Society Molly Chase, Springboard for the Arts* Leah Cooper, Minnesota Theater Alliance* Sharon DeMark, Minnesota Philanthropy Partners* Cindy Gehrig, Jerome Foundation* David Grabitske, Minnesota Historical Society Jennifer Halcrow, MacPhail Center for Music Trista Harris, Minnesota Council on Foundations* Tim Jennings, Children's Theatre Company Gulgun Kayim, City of Minneapolis Kate Lawson, Target* Arleta Little, The McKnight Foundation* Greg Nielsen, Metropolitan Regional Arts Council Ann Spencer, Skylark Opera Renae Youngs, Minnesota State Arts Board

Staff Support:

Minnesota Citizens for the Arts: Mark Albers and Ian Vaver. Minnesota State Arts Board: Kim Hocker

Minnesota CDP Task Force Members* (in addition to those listed above)

Sue Gens, Minnesota State Arts Board* Jeff Prauer, Forum of Regional Arts Councils of Minnesota* Matt Hill, Minnesota Historical Society* Mary Ann Aufderheide, VocalEssence*

Audience Survey Organizers:

Northwest Regional Arts Council: Mara Handel Region 2 Arts Council: Terri Widman Arrowhead Regional Arts Council: Bob DeArmond Lakes Region Arts Council: Maxine Adams Five Wings Arts Council: Mark Turner Southwest Minnesota Arts Council: Greta Murray East Central Regional Arts Council: Mary Minnick-Daniels

Central Minnesota Arts Board: Leslie LeCuyer Prairie Lakes Regional Arts Council: Brenda Flintrop Southeastern Minnesota Arts Council: Robin Pearson Metropolitan Regional Arts Council: Jeff Prauer, Greg Nielsen, Beth Burns, Bob Burns, Shannon Forney and Kelly Affeldt

Minnesota Historical Society: Katherine Wood, Sheila Brommel

Database:

Compiled with the assistance of CliftonLarsonAllen.

Sponsoring partners of the Creative Minnesota Project

- Minnesota Citizens for the Arts (MCA) www.mncitizensforthearts.org
- The McKnight Foundation: www.mcknight.org
- Target: https://corporate.target.com/corporateresponsibility/
- Bush Foundation: www.bushfoundation.org
- Mardag Foundation: http://www.mardag.org/
- Jerome Foundation: http://www.jeromefdn.org/
- Minnesota State Arts Board: http://www.arts.state.mn.us/
- Forum of Regional Arts Councils of Minnesota: http://www.arts.state.mn.us/racs/forum.htm
- Minnesota Historical Society: http://www.mnhs.org/about
- Ideas that Kick: www.ideasthatkick.com

Local Organizers:

Chuck Campbell, City of Duluth Mary Mathews, President, Duluth Public Art Commission Jessica Tillman, City of Duluth

Local Sponsor:



The City of Duluth's Participating Nonprofit Arts and Culture Organizations

This study could not have been completed without the cooperation of the 37 eligible nonprofit arts and culture organizations in the City of Duluth, listed below, that provided detailed financial and event attendance information about their organization.

American Indian Community Housing Organization; Arrowhead Chorale; Arrowhead Regional Arts Council; City of Duluth; Common Language; Duluth Art Institute; Duluth Children's Museum; Duluth Festival Opera; Duluth Fiber Handcrafters Guild; Duluth Superior Symphony Association; Duluth-Superior Area Educational Television Corporation; Gimaajii Mino Bimaadizimin; Lake Superior Chamber Orchestra; Lake Superior Marine Museum Association; Lake Superior Suzuki Talent Program; Lake Superior Youth Chorus; Lyric Opera of the North; Magic Smelt Puppet Troupe; Matinee Musicale; Minnesota Ballet; Nordic Center; Northern Bedrock Conservation Corps; Poetry Harbor; Prove Gallery; Ressl Dance!; Saint Louis County Historical Society; Sons of Norway; Sound Unseen International Duluth: Tamarack Dance Association: The College of Saint Scholastica: The Duluth Playhouse; Three Bridges International Chamber Music Festival; Tweed Museum of Art; Great Lakes Aquarium; Zeitgeist Arts; Glensheen Mansion; and Wise Fool Shakespeare.

The City of Duluth's Participating Nonprofit Arts and Culture Patrons

Additionally, this study could not have been completed without the cooperation of the 225 arts and culture audience members who generously took the time to complete the audience-intercept survey while attending a performance, event, or exhibit within the Arrowhead Region.

Other Acknowledgements:

Special thanks to the John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation and The Ruth Lilly Fund of Americans for the Arts for their financial support of the national implementation of the *Arts & Economic Prosperity IV* study.

Thanks also to the Cultural Data Project (CDP), a collaborative project of the Greater Philadelphia Cultural Alliance, The Greater Pittsburgh Arts Council, Pennsylvania Council on the Arts, The Pew Charitable Trusts, The William Penn Foundation, and The Heinz Endowments (in each participating state, including Minnesota, the CDP is also the result of a collaborative partnership of public and private funders and advocacy agencies). The CDP was created to strengthen arts and culture by documenting and disseminating information on the arts and culture sector. CDP data were used in the economic impact analysis for all study regions located in Arizona, California, Illinois, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota, New York, Ohio, Pennsylvania, and Rhode Island. For more information about the Cultural Data Project, visit www.culturaldata.org.

Special Thanks to:

City of Duluth - Don Ness, Mayor

Duluth City Council Zack Filipovich, Jay Fosle, Sharla Gardner, Howie Hanson, Jennifer Julsrud, Linda Krug, Emily Larson, Barb Russ, Joel Sipress

Duluth Public Arts Commission

Mary Mathews, Chair Pete Dingels, Jodi Broadwell, Sophie Spehar, Joan Henrik, Peter Spooner, Rachel Payne, Laurel Sanders, Mary Tennis

City of Duluth Staff Jessica Tillman, Tiffany Rossmann, Chuck Campbell

"This study shows that the arts and culture have measurable impact on the economy of our city. Investment in the arts and culture is an investment in the overall wellbeing of Duluth and the surrounding communities. The arts create vibrant and modern communities, help us educate the next generation of leaders and recruit and retain top talent from across the country. When people attend or produce art or art events they spend money and support our local economy. The arts play a critical role in stimulating creativity and in developing a vital community."

- Mary Mathews, President, Duluth Public Art Commission

THANK YOU TO OUR Sponsoring partners











THE MCKNIGHT FOUNDATION

The McKnight Foundation arts program is founded on the belief that Minnesota thrives when its artists thrive. The McKnight Foundation supports working artists to create and contribute to vibrant communities.



Mardag Foundation A family legacy. A partner for Minnesota





This activity is made possible in part by a grant provided by the Minnesota State Arts Board through an appropriation by the Minnesota State Legislature.





50

























Minnesota Citizens for the Arts 2233 University Avenue W. #355 St Paul, MN 55114 651-251-0868 staff@mncitizensforthearts.org